

STATE OF NEW JERSEY
DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
OFFICE OF FISCAL ACCOUNTABILITY AND COMPLIANCE

PATERSON INTERNAL AUDIT UNIT

HIRING PRACTICES

JULY 2015 - JUNE 2016

MARCH 2017

**NEW JERSEY DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
HIRING PRACTICES REVIEW REPORT
MARCH 2017**

Distribution List of Final Review Report

**Kimberley Harrington, Acting Commissioner
New Jersey Department of Education**

**Donnie Evans, State District Superintendent
Paterson Public Schools**

**Robert Bumpus, Assistant Commissioner
New Jersey Department of Education**

**Christopher Snyder, Director
Office of District Intervention and Support
New Jersey Department of Education**

**Robert J. Cicchino, Director
Office of Fiscal Accountability and Compliance
New Jersey Department of Education**

**Steven Hoffmann, Coordinating Auditor
New Jersey Department of Education**

**Daniel Sackner, Supervisor of Internal Audit
Paterson Public Schools**

**NEW JERSEY DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
HIRING PRACTICES REVIEW REPORT
MARCH 2017**

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Paterson Internal Audit Unit has conducted a review of the Paterson Public Schools' (District) hiring practices for FY 2015-2016. The purpose of the review was to verify that the District follows the Paterson Board of Education Policies and Regulations when hiring staff. The review consisted of a sample of 31 new hires out of a total of 311 individuals who were hired during FY 2015-2016.

As a result of the review, the following deficiencies were noted:

- For 29 out of 31 new hires sampled, the District was unable to provide documentation that supported the selection of the successful applicant for each position.
- The District hired a candidate who did not meet the qualifications of the job description
- The District did not follow the proper time frame for interviewing and hiring a candidate.
- The District could not provide some of the requested job postings for previous hires.

REVIEW SCOPE

Paterson Internal Audit Unit auditors reviewed the District's hiring practices for FY 2015-2016. The review consisted of a sample of 31 individuals who were hired during the fiscal year. The auditors reviewed the job posting, list of candidates, interview summaries, Criminal History Records and certifications if applicable. The purpose of the review was to verify that the District followed the Paterson Board of Education Policies and Standard Operating Procedures (SOP) and to ensure that the hiring process was fair and competitive. In addition, the review was conducted to confirm a vacancy existed, posting requests were submitted and approved by the Personnel Review Committee before the vacancy was posted, and the job opportunity was posted on the AppliTrack System for 10 consecutive days. AppliTrack is a system used by the District that allows them to post job vacancies, review applications, and schedule interviews. The auditors also attempted to verify the job postings for previous hires to ensure the job requirements were the same. The auditors interviewed the Director of Human Resources to gain an understanding of the hiring process.

The review scope included detailed testing to determine whether:

- a vacancy existed;
- posting requests were properly approved;
- posting appeared in the AppliTrack system for a minimum of 10 days;
- interview documentation existed, including a tabulation of candidates' rankings and a rationale for selecting a candidate.

**NEW JERSEY DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
HIRING PRACTICES REVIEW REPORT
MARCH 2017**

BACKGROUND

The procedures for new hires are outlined in the District's SOP entitled "Hiring Employee Procedures." To hire someone, a posting request is submitted and approved by the Personnel Review Committee. The posting is then posted on the AppliTrack System. Once the posting deadline has passed, applications are reviewed by the school administrator (principal, vice principal, or designee) and/or the department administrator who requested the posting, a team interview is conducted and a recommendation is made concerning who to hire. A Personnel Transaction Form (PTF) is completed and approved by the appropriate personnel. The interview data sheet, questions and a copy of credentials should be attached to the PTF. Once that information is reviewed by Department of Human Resource Services, it is forwarded to Position Control and the Business Administrator for approval. The form is then approved by the Director of Human Resources and the Deputy or State District Superintendent. At that time, the candidate is contacted by the District to begin completing the necessary paperwork for hiring. Once all the paperwork is reviewed, the PTF is keyed in and becomes a permanent record. At that time, the candidate signs a contract and enrolls with the offices of Health Benefits and Pension. The PTF is then reported to the Board of Education.

The remainder of this report details the auditor's findings.

FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

1. **For 29 out of 31 new hires sampled, the District was unable to provide documentation that supported the selection of the successful applicant for each position.**

The auditors reviewed 31 personnel files in the sample and noted that 29 did not contain any documentation supporting the applicant selected for the position. Specifically, evidence of the scoring and ranking of applicants by the interview committee and the rationale for selection of the successful candidate was not available. District SOP, section III (f) states, "A team interview is conducted and a recommendation made to hire"; and III (h) states, "the interview data sheet (ATTACHMENT A) (essentially an evaluation form), interview questions, and a copy of credentials is attached to the Personnel Transaction Form." Interview notes for the applicants chosen in the sample were on file for 27 out of the 31 hires, but documentation for ranking the successful applicant or the rationale for the selection did not exist. Discussion with the District personnel determined the paperwork is not centrally located and in most instances it is retained by the originator. In addition, the District was unable to locate the documentation upon request.

**NEW JERSEY DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
HIRING PRACTICES REVIEW REPORT
MARCH 2017**

Recommendation

The auditors recommend the District ensures adequate information is kept on file, readily available, and centrally located in order to ensure a fair and adequate hiring process. Results of team interviews and corresponding recommendations must be documented. The District should consider revising the SOP to ensure that proper evidence is readily on file.

2. **The District hired a candidate who did not meet the qualifications of the job description.**

One of the new hires selected was for the position of Chief Human Capital Officer. This position was most recently filled on February 17, 2016. The posting required an administrative certificate, a Master's Degree and five years' experience as a teacher or counselor. A review of the file determined the candidate did not possess the required credentials. The contract gave the candidate the opportunity to obtain the proper certification and Master's Degree within two years of the hire date. The employee subsequently resigned from the District effective January 6, 2017. The auditors were unable to obtain documentation to support the decision regarding the hiring of the candidate.

Recommendation

The auditors recommend the District implements procedures to ensure that all hired personnel have the credentials and/or certifications specified in the posting.

3. **The District did not follow the proper time frame for interviewing and hiring a candidate.**

One candidate for the position of Chemistry Teacher was interviewed on August 12, 2015, three days prior to the opening date of the posting date for the position, August 15, 2015. The individual was subsequently hired on September 29, 2015, one day prior to the closing date for the selection process, September 30, 2015. According to the Human Resource Standard Operating Procedure III (c) Posting/job opportunity is generated by the Human Resource Services and posted on the AppliTrack System for ten (10) consecutive days. If it is the intent of the District to keep the posting open longer than 10 days, the posting should specify "or until filled," rather than a fixed closing date.

Recommendation

The auditors recommend the District follows the SOP to assure the best candidate is chosen.

**NEW JERSEY DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
HIRING PRACTICES REVIEW REPORT
MARCH 2017**

4. The District was unable to provide some of the requested job postings for previous hires.

Part of the review scope was to verify that the job requirements were not tailored to specific candidates. In order to do this, the auditors attempted to compare the prior job posting to the current posting. The auditors requested the previous job posting for nine out of the 31 positions selected in the sample. The District was only able to provide four out of nine postings. The four postings provided contained the same job requirements as the current posting.

Recommendation

The auditors recommend the District ensures that adequate records are kept for all postings.

Auditor:

Janeth Molina

Submitted by:



Daniel Sackner

Supervising Auditor

Approved by:



Steven Hoffmann

Coordinating Auditor

**PATERSON PUBLIC SCHOOLS
CANDIDATE EVALUATION**

(Elementary)

Name: _____
 Team: _____
 Certification Area: _____
 Subject: _____

Directions: Candidate responses are to be judged in relation to anticipated responses on a scale of 10 (high) to 1 (low).

QUESTIONS	SCORE	COMMENT (OPTIONAL)
1. You are teaching a lesson - What steps are generally followed during a lesson presentation?		
2. How would you use student evaluation, standardized test scores, criterion referenced tests, teacher-made tests, etc.		
3. Describe an ideal teacher-student relationship.		
4. What are the ingredients of an ideal classroom management program?		
5. Explain your views of parent involvement in the school system.		

Total Score: _____

Please indicate your judgment of the following:

	GOOD	AVERAGE	LOW
1. Personal appearance			
2. Poise/stability			
3. Ability to present ideas			
4. Proper use of grammar/speech			
5. Professional attitude			

Should this candidate be invited to a second interview?
 Yes _____ No _____

Interviewer's Name: _____

Date: _____

Additional comments: _____

CORRECTIVE ACTION PLAN

Name of School: **Paterson Public School**
 Type of Audit: **Internal**
 Date of Board Meeting: **5/17/17**
 Contact Person: **Luis M. Rojas**
 Telephone Number: **973-321-0625**

County: **Passaic**

AUDIT FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATION	CORRECTIVE ACTION APPROVED BY THE BOARD	METHOD OF IMPLEMENTATION	PERSON RESPONSIBLE FOR IMPLEMENTATION	COMPLETION DATE OF IMPLEMENTATION
<p>1. Finding: For 29 out of 31 new hires sampled, the District was unable to provide documentation that supported the selection of the successful applicant for each position</p> <p>Recommendation: Ensure adequate information is kept on file, readily available, and centrally located in order to ensure a fair and adequate hiring process.</p>	<p>Hiring managers will be required to submit as part of their supporting documents (attached to the PTF) a minimum of a posting, interview score sheets with overall ratings, certification (if appropriate), resume, notes and any other documentation necessary to support the recommendation to hire.</p> <p>Additionally, if hired, every applicant will have copies of the backup documentation placed in their personnel file. This will allow for the documentation to be readily available for future referencing.</p> <p>Human Capital will review its current SOP on hiring and will update the document accordingly.</p>	<p>Brief all Directors, Principals, Vice Principals, Supervisors and other hiring managers of the new requirement.</p> <p>Reject or place in abeyance hiring the individual being recommended for hire if the PTF is not accompanied with a minimum of a posting, interview score sheets with overall ratings, certification (if appropriate), resume, notes and any other documentation necessary to support the recommendation to hire.</p> <p>Additionally, the new hire checklist will be updated to ensure a posting, interview score sheets with overall ratings, certification (if appropriate), resume, notes and any other documentation necessary to support the recommendation to hire is in the individuals' personnel file.</p> <p>HC Coordinators will be responsible for ensuring copies of the documentation will be filed into the personnel file and HC administration will review each personnel file to ensure the documentation is there</p>	<p>Briefing Hiring Managers: Interim Chief of Human Capital</p> <p>Prior to approving the PTF: Interim Chief of Human Capital</p> <p>Ensuring documents are incorporated in the personnel file: HC Coordinator & Supervisor</p>	<p>July 2017</p>


 CHIEF SCHOOL ADMINISTRATOR

5/23/17
 DATE


 SCHOOL BUSINESS ADMINISTRATOR /DATE

CORRECTIVE ACTION PLAN

Name of School: Paterson Public School
 Type of Audit: Internal
 Date of Board Meeting: 5/17/17
 Contact Person: Luis M. Rojas
 Telephone Number: 973-321-0625

County: Passaic

AUDIT FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATION	CORRECTIVE ACTION APPROVED BY THE BOARD	METHOD OF IMPLEMENTATION	PERSON RESPONSIBLE FOR IMPLEMENTATION	COMPLETION DATE OF IMPLEMENTATION
<p>2. Finding: The District hired a candidate who did not meet the qualifications of the job description.</p> <p>Recommendation: Implement procedures to ensure that all hired personnel have the credentials and/or certifications specified in the posting</p>	<p>The Supervisor and Interim Chief of HC will review backup documentation when the PTF is first received to ensure the candidate has the proper credentials/certification specified in the posting and Code. If the backup documentation does not support the requirements outlined in the posting or Code, the PTF will be returned to the initiator for improper supporting documentation</p>	<p>The supporting documentation attached to the PTF will be reviewed at different levels within HC and matched to the posting and job description to ensure the recommended new hire has the proper qualifications and/or certification (if required) to hold the position.</p>	<p>Interim Chief of HC, HC Coordinators and HC Supervisor</p>	<p>July 2017</p>
<p>3. Finding: The District did not follow the proper time frame for interviewing and hiring a candidate.</p> <p>Recommendation: If it is the intent of the District to keep the posting open longer than ten (10) days, the posting should specify "or until filled", rather than a fixed closing date.</p>	<p>All postings will specify "10 days or until filled", thus fulfill the 10 day posting requirement for vacancies. The district will follow the current SOP to ensure equity in hiring all candidates chosen.</p>	<p>Edit the posting template to reflect "10 days or until filled".</p>	<p>Employee Relations and Support Manager</p>	<p>July 2017</p>


 CHIEF SCHOOL ADMINISTRATOR

5/23/17
 DATE


 SCHOOL BUSINESS ADMINISTRATOR /DATE

CORRECTIVE ACTION PLAN

Name of School: Paterson Public School
 Type of Audit: Internal
 Date of Board Meeting: 5/17/17
 Contact Person: Luis M. Rojas
 Telephone Number: 973-321-0625

County: Passaic

AUDIT FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATION	CORRECTIVE ACTION APPROVED BY THE BOARD	METHOD OF IMPLEMENTATION	PERSON RESPONSIBLE FOR IMPLEMENTATION	COMPLETION DATE OF IMPLEMENTATION
<p>4. Finding: The District was unable to provide some of the requested job postings for previous hires.</p> <p>Recommendation: The Auditor recommends the District ensures that adequate records are kept for all postings.</p>	<p>All vacancies will be reviewed by HC staff and appropriate postings will be advertised to select the most qualified candidates. Templates have been designed to ensure that all job requirements are uniform for each position posted</p>	<p>A spreadsheet will be designed to track that all vacancies have been posted before hiring a qualified candidate into each position. Templates will be available for all initiators of vacancies to ensure uniformity in posting requirements.</p>	<p>HC staff</p>	<p>July 2017</p>


 CHIEF SCHOOL ADMINISTRATOR

5/23/17
 DATE


 SCHOOL BUSINESS ADMINISTRATOR /DATE